The Development of Chinese Versification

Studies on the shih, tz'u and ch'ü [1] genres

By Kurt W. Radtke
(Hamilton / New Zealand)

As a result of my studies on versification patterns in hsiao-ling poetry of the Yuan dynasty I became more interested in the study of the nature of Chinese versification generally: In this paper I confine myself to an analytical study of shih, tz'u and ch'ü versification [2]. It can safely be said that the versification patterns of genres preceding the chin-t'i shih [3] fall into a completely different category and therefore deserve a separate treatment [3]. In dealing with questions of Chinese versification the traditional terminology was generally found to be very useful. It seemed however advisable to make an additional distinction between the two concepts 'prosody' and 'versification'.

Prosody and Versification

The term "prosodic features" will be used to designate patterns that arise from the recurrent use of identical or similar phonetic features in the whole or a part of a particular text. Metrical features differ from prosodic features in that such patterns are common to a variety of texts. The terms "prosody" and "versification" refer to the phenomena of prosodic features and metrical

---

features. A good example for prosodic features exists in the following lines from a poem by Tu Fu:

wu-hu, ho shih yen-ch’ien t’u-wu chien t’z’u wu, wu-lu tu p’o, shou lung, szu yi tsu [6].

Here, the recurrence of the vowel “u” constitutes a prosodic pattern in the sense of the definition given above. There is, however, only a small chance that this particular pattern will have been imitated in other poems; therefore it cannot be called a metrical pattern. Metrical patterns are prosodic patterns common in a number of texts chosen for consideration. Because of the subjectiveness of this choice, there will always be a certain amount of arbitrariness in the versification rules established on that textual basis. By excluding from or including texts into the basic sample from which the patterns will have to be deducted the rules set up can either have a more specific or a more general character.

As a point of departure for this study on Chinese versification I have taken the genre called chin-t’i shih with its different subgenres chüeh-chü [7], lü-shih [8] and p’ai-lü [9] (or ch’ang-lü) which are all characterized by the same kind of metrical patterns. All lines consist of either five or seven characters (rarely six characters). The number of possible metrical patterns for these lines is limited. All patterns can be shown to follow the same general versification laws. For reasons not yet wholly understood the p’ing-sheng is normally contrasted with the three remaining tones in classical versification, thus forming two tone classes, the p’ing tone class (p’ing-sheng) and the ts’e tone class consisting of the shang, ch’ü and ju tones. The formal differences between the three sub-genres lie in the different number of lines. In all sub-genres one can distinguish groups of four lines, between which simple rules are valid: the even characters (i.e., the second, fourth, or sixth character) of the first and fourth as well as of the second and third lines belong to the same tone class with those of the first line contrasting with the corresponding tones of the second line. In addition, the last characters of the second and fourth lines rhyme; final rhyme is optional in the first line. The remain-

---

[5] 茅屋為秋風所破歌
ing tones are chosen in accordance with some general or what I wish to call Basic Versification Laws.

Basic Versification Laws

In lines with five or seven characters, there is a caesura dividing the line into a final part A of three characters, and a second part of two or four characters preceding part A, called B.

I. In part A, three tones of the same tone class may never follow each other. There does exist the possibility of a part A containing tones from the tone class "ts'ê" only. Because of its rare occurrence I treat this case as an exception.

II. If B consists of four characters, the second and the fourth character must belong to different tone classes.

III. A and B are combined in such a way that the second and sixth characters belong to one tone class and the fourth one to the other tone class. If B consists of two characters, the second and fourth characters belong to different tone classes. There is one exception: if the last two characters in a line belong to the "ts'ê" tone class, the neighbouring even characters may also belong to the second tone class with a contrasting second character in a seven character line belonging to the first tone class.

IV. The tones of the odd characters may be chosen freely; the only restriction in addition to Law I is that if the last character of a line belongs to the first tone class there cannot be only one character of the first tone class separated from the last character.

Positions in which tones may be chosen freely are called "unimportant positions". The laws presented here seem to have some advantages over most other attempts:

1) they recognize the important role of the caesura for the structure of a line; and
2) they concentrate on the versification of a single line lü-chü and are therefore more useful in perceiving the affinity of tz'u and ch'ü versification with chin-t'i shih versification even in cases when lines of different length appear in these genres.

---

8 This is a slightly altered version of the Laws as first published in RADIKE, Influence, 130—1. These laws were originally formulated as laws for isolated lü-chü (single lines in chin-t'i shih which do comply with the accepted versification rules) in order to show that these laws are also valid, with some modifications, for most lines in ch'ü compositions with four or more characters.

9 WANG Li (Han-yü shih-lü hsüeh 803 ff.) used different forms of lü-chü in establishing a greatly simplified ch'ü-p'u [14]. He gave no analytical rules governing all lü-chü. WANG Chung-lin's Chung-kuo wen-hsüeh chih sheng-lü yen-chiu presents a wealth of material in an uncoherent and unsystematic fashion. FRANKEL, Review Liu (pp. 260—70) has some valuable comments on total patterns; the patterns suggested are far too strict. HSÜEH Feng-sheng's more comprehensive study 'Elements in the Metrics of T'ang Poetry' does not have all advantages of the approach suggested here.

12 曲譜
The Origins of Chin-t'i shih Versification

The honour of having given the lü-shih its final shape is generally given to Shen Ch'üan-ch'i (d. 713) and Sung Chih-wen (d. about 710). Lines with metrical patterns governed by the Basic Versification Laws, so-called lü-chü, appear long before the early T'ang dynasty: the question is, whether the occurrence of such patterns is due to coincidence or was consciously sought after. Their origin has been sought in poetry of as early as the Chien-an period of the Han dynasty (194-220). In my opinion this date seems to be too early. One wonders whether lü-chü were intended in some poems by Shen Yüeh (441-513), the poet who was one of the first writers to compose a treatise on the so-called "four tones" szu-sheng. As an example, I would like to present the tone pattern of his poem entitled Lin Kao-t'ai:

1) -e- 2) -e- 3) -e- 4) -e-
5) 1 6) 1 7) 1 8) 1
8 -CD
8 -CD
8 -CD
8 -CD

In the first half of the poem (lines 1-4) the even characters of the first and third as well as the second and fourth lines belong to the same tone classes, whereas the second part is formally identical with a five character chüeh-chü. Mei Tsu-lin doubts whether the division between two tone classes p'ing and ts'e was consciously adhered to in the versification of poetry from the Six Dynasties (420-588). A similar opinion is held by Chou Fa-kao. This question awaits future detailed examination.

---

10 See YUAN Chen, (Yüan-shih ch'ang-ch'ing chi, chüan 56, p. 3b).
11 Chu-goku gakugei daijiten, 1354.
12 See CHOU Fa-kao, Shuo ping-ts'e, 153. CHOU writes (p. 154) that "although the chin-t'i shih had its first beginnings in the Ch'i (479-502) and Liang (502-557) dynasties . . . it was formally established only during the beginning of the T'ang". Similar to some other tonal languages (e.g. Yoruba) the tonal contour of a syllable is a very important characteristic. Chinese of the T'ang period e.g. distinguished four of such tones (szu-sheng), the p'ing-sheng, the shang-sheng, the ch'ü-sheng, and the ju-sheng. It should be noted that the most widely used transliteration systems for Chinese do not usually indicate the tones; a drawback not only misleading linguistically, but also responsible for a complete disregard of the tones by many foreigners.
13 Ku-shih yüan, chüan 12, p. 295. Following common practice, tones of the ping tone class are indicated by a horizontal stroke, those of the ts'e tone class by a vertical stroke.
14 Mei Tsu-lin, Tones and Prosody, 108.
15 CHOU Fa-kao, Shuo ping-ts'e, 154: " . . . Only after the establishment of chin-t'i, the lü and the chüeh (i.e. chin-t'i shih, lü-shih, chüeh-chü) poetry was the alternation of p'ing and ts'e tones (shang, chü and ju) very strictly used to create rhythm (yünlü) [17], and were p'ing tones used at the same time in great numbers for rhyming." He also mentions an anthology of the Ch'ing dynasty (1644-1911) entitled Pa-lai shih-hsüan by WANG K'ai-yün which contains three chüan of "new style poetry" [written after the Ch'i dynasty]. It may be supposed that lü-chü play a prominent part in this part of the anthology which I was unable to consult. One may wonder about the influence of lü-chü in some poems from the Ku-shih yüan in addition to Shen Yüeh's quoted above; see chüan 13, p. 306 Tseng Kuo T'ung-lu by JEN Fang [18]

One may finally mention that apart from chin-t'ī shih in the strict sense, that is with lines of five or seven characters, there exist poems that are clearly influenced by chin-t'ī shih versification, yet are distinguished by lines of different length. I am under the impression that writers of shih-hua (essays on poets and poems, often anecdotal) do not hesitate to include these forms in their treatises while these *irregular* forms are often neglected elsewhere.

**P'ing and Ts'e Tone Classes**

For metrical purposes the four tones szu-sheng of Middle Chinese are divided into two tone classes, called *p'ing* and *ts'e*. The *p'ing* tone class consists of the *p'ing* tone only, whereas the *ts'e* tone class consists of the *shang*(sheng), the *ch'ü*(sheng), and the *ju*(sheng). In the course of the development of Middle Chinese into modern Chinese many characters changed their tones or even tone class.

For chin-t'ī shih versification Middle Chinese continued to be its basis long after it had ceased to be spoken. The reason behind the division of tones into two classes is not altogether clear. Chou Fakao argued that one of the distinctive features was the length of vowels (and syllables), the length of a *p'ing-sheng* being longer than that of a *ts'e-sheng*. Mei Tsu-lin doubted the conclusiveness of Chou's evidence:

> ... the only clear conclusion to be drawn from Chou's data is that the rising tone is short.

(Liang dynasty); p. 310 Feng ho ch'un-yeh ying-ling, p. 311 Yung Ch'ang-hsin kung-chung ts'ao, both by Yü Chien-wu (Liang dynasty).

Poems with six character lines often show alternation of tone classes in characters in even positions. (See Leng-chai yeh-hua, chüan 1,3a). See also the five six character poems by Su Shih (1063—1101) (Su Tung-p'o chi, hsü-chi, vol. 10, chüan 2, p. 88). For another irregular poem, see e.g. Ch'o-keng lu, chüan 5, p. 76 (TENG Chung-chai, Che-ku shih).

On the term "Middle Chinese", see PULLEYBLANK, Late Middle Chinese, 203 ff. Whereas for the tone pattern (i.e. the pattern that is governed by the Basic Versification Laws), the distinction between tone classes is essential, tones are kept separate for rhyming purposes. In other words, the syllable *tu* with the tonal contour of a *p'ing-sheng* does not rhyme with the syllable *tu* in the *ch'ü-sheng*. The first and second tones of modern Chinese are two varieties of former *p'ing-sheng*. The third tone developed from the previous *shang-sheng*, the fourth tone from the *ch'ü-sheng*. It should be remembered that a number of words changed their tonal contours in the course of time. In Chinese, one may also refer to the modern four tones of the standard northern dialect as *yang-p'ing*, *yin-p'ing*, *shang* and *ch'ü*. In contrast with former practice, *tu* syllables with any tonal contour do rhyme.

There were a variety of handbooks consulted by poets when in doubt about the correct tone and rhyme of a particular character. Let me here only mention the Kuang-yün (Sung), the Li-pu yün-jüeh (Sung), and the Ku-chin yün-hui chü-yao (Yüan).

20 Chou Fa-kao, Shuo p'ing-ts'e, 156. This opinion is also found in JAKOBSON, Linguistics and Poetics, 306.

21 Mei Tsu-lin, Tones and Prosody, 107.
Mei lists four hypotheses concerning the tone classes without feeling able to decide in favour of one of them. Stimson\textsuperscript{22} and Mei Tsu-lin\textsuperscript{23} did not succeed to demonstrate the aesthetic effects of chin-t'i shih versification based on the p'ing-ts'e division.

I agree with Shibata Minoru that we are still not able (I should rather say: not any more!) to understand the full implications of this device\textsuperscript{24}. One may nevertheless assume that it was probably more than a purely "artificial" ingredient in chin-t'i shih, at least during the T'ang period and some time before and after\textsuperscript{25}. It should also be remembered that a special treatment of the p'ing-sheng even in modern dialects which have lost their ju-sheng may be a remnant of a period when the p'ing-ts'e division in chin-t'i shih was fully justified from prosodic qualities of the language of that time. Pian made the following observations on the influence of the p'ing-ts'e division on modern Peking opera:

"The classical rules of tonal organization in traditional-style poetry still have great influence today...\textsuperscript{26}"

"Closer imitation of the contour of tones occurs in the less stereotyped variants. In these cases one finds a distinction between First and Second Tones and Third and Fourth Tones\textsuperscript{27}."

Other remnants of p'ing-ts'e divisions in modern popular genres are perhaps found in the t'an-huang\textsuperscript{27} (ballad-type) genre. There are statements to the effect that a caesura is necessary after the first p'ing-sheng in either the second or the fourth positions\textsuperscript{28}. One will immediately notice the fact that here, too, seems to be a distinction between important and unimportant positions as in chin-t'i shih. The influence of chin-t'i shih versification on other genres deserves future attention by scholars.

The Role of P'ing-ts'e in Modern Chanting

In spite of the fact that the chanting of poetry was formerly part of Chinese artistic life there seem to be hardly any useful studies on this topic\textsuperscript{29}. The study of traditional chanting is largely encumbered by the lack of available recordings, or their bad quality. Recently, a number of recordings were published by the Chinese University of Hong Kong, yet it will not be difficult...

\textsuperscript{22} Stimson, "The Sound of a T'ang Poem", passim. In spite of its linguistic pretension this essay remains very disappointing just because all references to the nature of the p'ing-ts'e tone classes, the contour of tones etc. are not supported by the necessary evidence.

\textsuperscript{23} Mei Tsu-lin, Tones and Prosody, passim.

\textsuperscript{24} Shibata Minoru, Chügoku shin minka no rinzu, 106.

\textsuperscript{25} Cf. Chu Kuang-ch'ien's remarks on the deliberate use of p'ing and ts'e in classical poetry (Chung-kuo shih-chung su-sheng ti ten-hsi, esp. 33).

\textsuperscript{26} Pian, Text Setting, 243.

\textsuperscript{27} Pian, Text Setting, 247. (Cf. footnote 17)

\textsuperscript{28} Su-chü ch'ü-tiao chieh-shao, 7. See also Hu Hui-ch'ien, Chung-kuo min-ko yen-chiu, 111. Although I had access to t'an-huang scores lack of time did not permit to include analyses of text-music relationship in this genre.

\textsuperscript{29} Chao, Tones presents a very brief introduction to this topic.
to note that most of the chanting there is not in a traditional style. There can be no doubt that for any serious study only chanting in dialects which preserve a separate ju-sheng may be considered (others may serve for comparative purposes). Only in those dialects does one find a system of tones relatively close to that of Middle Chinese which included the ju-sheng in the ts'e tone class. An analysis of chanting in Cantonese indicated that ping tones in important positions (i.e. the second, fourth, and sixth characters in a seven character line) were generally longer than ts'e in important positions.

Tz'U Poetry — a Link between Chin-t'i shih and Hsiao-ling Poetry

The widespread occurrence of lü-chü, obligatory in chin-t'i shih, in tz'u and ch'ü versification constitutes the major formal link between the three genres. Right from its very beginning lü-chü were widely used in the tz'u genre. The explanation for this phenomenon must be sought in the origin of the tz'u, which will presently be discussed. One of the major difficulties in understanding the formal structure of the tz'u is the fact that on the one hand, as traditionally held, the tones (of each character?) were chosen in accordance with the melody of that song, and that one observes the appearance of relatively fixed tone patterns in the majority of all lines in tz'u poetry — the lü-chü.

The Origin of the Tz'u

It seems that until now the role of extant Tunhuang manuscripts of popular songs from the early T'ang dynasty has quite often been neglected in recent studies on the origin of the tz'u. In my opinion, the inclusion of these songs would not greatly alter the view on the development of the tz'u taken by Aoki Masaru. A historical survey of metrical patterns of different types of tz'u melodies shows that the earliest anthologies abound in patterns that originated formally by slight variations of chin-t'i shih patterns, or even patterns identical

---

Footnotes:
30 This was confirmed by Prof. Lo K'ang-lieh, Hong Kong, with whom I discussed these recordings (bibliography, Chung-wen Ta-hsüeh).
31 For this purpose I used the not very sensitive Mingogram equipment which nevertheless gave some useful results. A detailed description of that analysis necessitates a somewhat lengthy technical discussion which goes beyond the scope of this paper. I refer in particular to a recording in Cantonese of Tu Fu's poem entitled Teng-Kao (see bibliography under Chung-wen Ta-hsüeh).
32 To some degree, rhyming practices in chin-t'i shih and early tz'u as well as in the late tz'u and ch'ü are very similar. On lü-chü, see footnote 8.
34 Aoki Masaru, Shikaku no chōlanku, esp. 7 ff. In spite of its early date his study has not yet been superseded.
with those of chin-t’i shih. In addition, one notices that versification patterns for one and the same melody differed frequently, while their form did not essentially deviate from the lü-chü and its variants. Later on the development of new, complex structures was greatly enhanced through the work of Liu Yung (11th c.), whose name is closely connected with the creation of man-tzu melodies. Development of new metrical overall patterns for song texts seems to have been effected mainly by the influence of the different musical structures of tz’u melodies. Aoki’s hypothesis which asserts the close relationship between chin-t’i shih and the tz’u was emphatically challenged by Baxter:

“...metrical irregularity was the most distinctive literary characteristic of the genre when it began to be generally recognized as a separate branch of poetry. On the other hand, the theory that the tz’u is derived from more regular verse forms notably fails to relate it to the ch’ang-tuan-chü tradition...”

Baxter does not try to refute the factual evidence that Aoki Masaru had produced.

“There is no doubt that he (Wen T'ing-yün 8th c.) shaped his words directly to music, for his biography in Chiu T’ang shu says that in his youth he became noted for just that. It is clear then that the forms of Wen T’ing-yün’s tz’u were based not on transmutations of literary canons, but directly on the demands of music.”

Baxter seems to assume that the lü-chü in tz’u poetry is a somewhat foreign element (“literary canon”) and that writers of tz’u chose the tones of the characters independent of extraneous rules according to the demands of the song melody. Unfortunately he never tried to verify his point of view against evidence from Wen T’ing-yün’s own tz’u as preserved, for instance, in the Hua-chien chi. Among the melodies most favoured by Wen

---

35 Aoki Masaru, loco cit.; Chu Ch’ien-chih, Chung-kuo yin-yüeh wen-hsüeh shih 183 f., to cite only a few works.
36 Lo K’ang-lieh, T’ien-tzu ch’en-tzu shih-li, 23.1; this article received unfortunately no wide circulation.
37 Nagata Natsuki, Shi shi kyoku no setten, passim; Feng-Liu, Liu Yung ho man-tzu, passim; Liu, The Lyrics of Liu Yung, passim; cf. also the remarks on man-tzu in Jen Chung-min, Tun-huang ch’ü ch’ü-t’an, 329, and a feature possibly related to it, the lan-tiao[39] “potpourri” style, in Hsia Ch’eng-lao, Tzu-tiao yüeh-li, 165. See also Pickens, Secular Songs, 135: “... in the light of Chiang K’uei’s[39] seventeen secular songs, it looks as if the basic rhythmic framework of ling and man was... a structure composed of four or eight musical lines respectively, each of eight beats.”
38 Baxter, Metrical Origins, 145; Aoki Masaru, loco cit.
39 The term ch’ang-tuan chü refers to lines of uneven length following each other.
40 Baxter, Metrical Origins, 144. For similar views, a. o. Lu Ch’ien, Ling-tzu yü-lun, esp. 24; Lung Mu-hsün, Tzu-t’i chih yen-chin, passim. While Lung Mu-hsün acknowledges the role of the new metrical patterns (Lun p’ing-ts’e szu-sheng, esp. 8–9) his formulation of the laws behind them is too simplistic: “Let two p’ing and two ts’e alternate, this style originates from the rules of the chin-t’i of the T’ang.”
41 In addition to Lu Ch’ien and Lung Mu-hsün, op. cit., cf. also Wu Mei, Tzu-hsieh t’ung-lun, 9 f., and Kung Ying-te, Lun tz’u ti yin-lü yü szu-sheng, 155.

---

[35] 溫庭筠
are p'u-sa-man, yang-liu-chih, and nan-ko-tzu⁴⁸ in which the influence of chin-t'i shih versification can hardly be overlooked⁴². I have tried to locate the evidence Baxter refers to from the Chiu T'ang-shu; it is most probably the following phrase:

"Able to pursue the sound of strings and flutes he made captivating tz'u⁴³."

There can be no question that this means that in some way or other there exists a kind of harmonious relationship between song text and melody. In order to find out just how this harmonization was realized statements of an abstract nature as the one above can hardly be used as the only source. At this point one cannot avoid a discussion of this problem on the basis of the only scores of tz'u melodies cum texts available — some 17 songs by Chiang K'uei.

Text-Music Relationships in Chiang K'uei's Tz'u

Chiang Kuei's 17 tz'u poems are the only specimens of tz'u or ch'ü songs for which the scores have been preserved⁴⁴. There is, of course, no proof for the assumption made here that the technique employed by Chiang K'uei in "harmonizing" text and music was the same as that of other tz'u writers. In the absence of evidence to the contrary it seems reasonable to regard Chiang's technique as representative. Up to date Ch'iu Ch'ung-sun is apparently the only scholar who studied the problem of the relationship speech-tone versus melodic movement fairly extensively⁴⁵. With regard to the use of tones he comes to the following conclusions:

The direction of the melodic movement greatly influences the choice of tones, yet there are quite a few examples in which tones are used seemingly not in accordance with it. A statistical analysis shows that the p'ing-sheng is most appropriate in movements directed downwards, and unfit for upward movements; the shang-sheng is appropriate in upward movements, and not so much in downward ones; the ch'ü-sheng is most appropriate in upward movements, especially the yin-ch'ü⁴⁷ and most unfit for downward movements; the ju-sheng is appropriate in movements directed downwards, and not so much in upward movements⁴⁶. According to Ch'iu's sleuthing Chiang

⁴² Hua-chien chi, chüan 1, la—5b, 11a—13a, 13a—15a. For the tone patterns, see Tz'u-lü, chüan 4, 301; chüan 1, 175; chüan 1, 194. See also Tz'u-lü chien-ch'üeh 148, 130.
⁴³ Chiu T'ang-shu, chüan 190, 3589.1.
⁴⁴ Among many other studies I would like to cite Pian's study (Pian, Song Sources, esp. 33ff., 99ff.) and Picken's musical analysis (Picken, Secular Songs, passim). Both discuss the textual history of these scores and summarize previous scholarly achievements. Together with three short melodies from the Ch'ü-lü and some notations in the Shih-lin kuang-chi these are the only examples of early popular stock melodies for song writing. (Pian, Song Sources, 28—9). A list of easily accessible transcriptions is found in Picken, Central Asian Tunes, 547. Picken (Secular Songs) and Yang Yin-lu (Sung Chiang Pai-shih, esp. 44ff.) attempted rhythmic interpretations of Chiang's scores as well.
⁴⁵ Ch'iu Ch'ung-sun, Pai-shih tao-jen, esp. 150.
⁴⁶ Ch'iu Ch'ung-sun, Pai-shih tao-jen, 150.
K'uei's use of tones points to the group of dialects from the T'ai-hu basin. Since the ch'ü, in particular the northern ch'ü with which I am most concerned, is supposedly not based on the shape of tones in Chiang K'uei's dialect the technique for harmonizing individual tones with the melodic movement may very well differ there. A very strong objection against the principles underlying Ch'iu's interpretation was raised by Shen Chih-pai. According to Shen the notes from the scores are not necessarily the only notes that were actually sung, and he argues that others may have been added by the singer of a tz'u. For these reasons I decided to dispense with a further discussion of this problem. An analysis of characters with tones from different tone classes that appeared in corresponding positions of identical musical phrases proved more interesting since it is independent from the contours of individual tones.

Inconsistencies in the Choice of Tones in Chiang K'uei's Tz'u Songs

I Chiang K'uei (author), Shu-ying (name of the melody).
   a) ① K'o-li hsiang-feng; ② li-chiao huang-hun; ③ wu-yen tz'u-i hsiu-chu;
   b) ① Mo-szu ch'un-feng; ② pu-kuan ying-ying; ③ tsao-yü an-p'ai chin-wu;
   cont. a) ④ Chao-chün pu-kuan hu-sha yüan, ⑤ tan an-i chuang-nan chiang-pei;
   cont. b) ④ Huan-chiao i-p'ien sui-p'o chü; ⑤ yu ch'üeh-yüan yü-lung ai-chü;
   cont. a) ⑥ Hsien p'ei-huan yüeh yeh kuei-lai; ⑦ hua-tso tz'u hua yu-tu.
   cont. b) ⑤ Teng jen-shih ch'ung-mi yu-hsiang; ⑦ i ju hsiao-ch'üan heng-fu.

II Chiang K'uei, Ts'ui-lou-yin (name of melody).
   a) ① Han p'u ch'ü tz'u; ② hsin fan hu-pu chü;
   b) ① Yu ch'üan yu-hsi; ② yü -t'i ning-wang chiu;
   cont. a) ③ t'ing t'an-mu yüan-jung ko-ch'uei;
   cont. b) ③ t'an fang-ts'ao ch'i-ch'i ch'ien-li.

The partial text of Chiang K'uei's tz'u to the melodies shu-ying and ts'ui-lou-yin found above is arranged in such a way that passages with identical

---

47 Ch'iu's basis for indentifying Chiang's dialect with the T'ai-hu dialects was Lu Fu's descriptive study Szu-sheng shih-yen lu. See Ch'iu Ch'üang-sun, Pai-shih tao-jen, 152 ff., esp. 156.
48 Shen Chih-pai, Chung-kuo yin-yüeh, 34. See also Mark-Li, Speech Tone and Melody, passim. It appears that in some Chinese songs parts of the so-called "melody" are also dependent on the choice of speech-tones.
49 Chiang K'uei, Pai-shih tao-jen ko-chü, chüan 5, p. 4a.
50 Ibid., chüan 6, p. 2b.
melodic accompaniment appear in parallel lines. Because the beginning of
the melody in the two parts of each tz'u is different the first three lines were
omitted from the melody shu-ying. For the sake of convenience I quoted
only those lines from ts'ui-lou-yin in which different tone classes were
chosen for characters in corresponding positions. There were only a few
cases in which double readings resulted in ambiguities in the interpretation
of the tone patterns; since it seems impossible to find cogent arguments for
choosing one or the other reading, I have at times made arbitrary choices for
the readings of such words.

Discussion of tz'u versification: Chiang K'uei's songs shu-ying and ts'ui-
lou-yin

shu-ying. Most inconsistencies appear in unimportant positions. It must
be noted, though, that the structure of the fifth and sixth lines differ from
ordinary lü-chü. In those lines a ling-tzu is prefixed to a six character line
with the caesuras before each group of two characters x/x x/x x/x. A
comparison with other songs to the melody shu-ying (see next pages) shows
that the most common pattern for the third line is x 1 . x — . — 1. It is easily
seen that the third line of the first half in Chiang K'uei's shu-ying has a differ-

ent pattern: — — 1 1 . — 1 . This is, in fact, an irregular ao-chü pattern
which was later changed into a more "regular" pattern with contrasting tone
classes in even positions. One will, however, not be very wrong to claim that
in this particular case the essential feature of groups of two characters in
lines with an even number of characters is retained. One may even claim that
the deviation from this pattern in the other songs is a proof for the force
of the lü-chü.

ts'ui-lou-yin. In the five character lü-chü, the second line, the inconsistency
appears in the unimportant first position. The next line is like in the previous
song a six character line with a ling-tzu. There will be no room here to prove
my assumption that in such a line the ling-tzu behaves exactly like a ch'en-
tzu in the ch'ü genre, i.e. it does not underly restrictions as to the tone
class it must belong to.

Below follow examples for other songs to the melody shu-ying.

51 See Ch'iu Ch'iu, Pai-shih tao-jen, pp. 151, also 109—10.
52 For instance, K'an has a p'ing-sheng and a ts'e-sheng reading. It is known
that readings were sometimes chosen by poets contrary to the meaning with which
a particular reading is commonly associated. See, e.g. Yakö shiwa, p. 328.
53 Inconsistencies in tones are indicated by syllables in italics. The first
line appears to be 'irregular', in terms of the lü-chü principle. Even so, one notices
that the second and fourth syllables have contrasting tones.
54 On unimportant positions, see p. 3. Cf. HuAng Hsü-wu, Shih tz'u ch'ü ts'ung-t'an,
144 f. See also Liu, Liu Yung, 38. A ling-tzu is an initial word (usually a verb) govern-
ing one more lines grammatically, while itself contributing very little to the 'poetic'
content of those lines. Its main contribution to 'meaning' seems to lie in the alter-
ation of sound and rhythm of the line(s) it is prefixed to.
55 In a previous study on versification (RADTKE, Yüan San-ch'ü, 138) I proposed
the following definition: Although the number of characters in a line need not be

I Chang Yen (author)  

a) ① Chih-pei chih-nan;  
    ② i-yu i-wu;  
    ③ chi-tu pei-teng nan-che;  

b) ① mo-shi hua-kuang;  
    ② miao-ch’u ch’un-hen;  
    ③ pu-p’a li-ch’iao ch’uei-ch’‘e;  

cont. a) ④ i-hsi ch’ien-nü li-hun ch’u;  
    ⑤ huan-pu ch’u ch’ien-ts’un shih-chieh;  

cont. b) ④ huan ching hai-shang jan-hsi ch’u;  
    ⑤ chao shui ti san-hu ju-huo;  

cont. a) ⑥ k’an yeh-shen chu-wai heng-hsieh;  
    ⑦ ying tu kuo-yün ming-mieh;  

cont. b) ⑥ tso nung-te chu-hsing t’ien-han;  
    ⑦ k’ung-tui i-t’ing hsiang-hsüeh;  

II Ch’en Yün-p’ing (author)  

a) ① fu-hsiao p’ing-hsü;  
    ② ch’un-pu sheng-han;  
    ③ i-tan shou-i chu-chu;  

b) ① i-p’ien ts’ang-yen;  
    ② ke-tuan chia-shan;  
    ③ meng-jao shih-ch’uang lo-wu;  

cont. a) ④ tung-feng pu-chieh ch’ui ch’ou hsing;  
    ⑤ tan lang-ts’ao ch’i-ch’eng nan-pei;  

cont. b) ④ hsiang-k’an pu-yen chao huan mu;  
    ⑤ suan chi-tu ch’ih lan kan ch’u;  

cont. a) ⑥ jen wu-huang yao-so hsiu-p’in;  
    ⑦ mei-wu wei shui ch’ou-tu.  

cont. b) ⑥ tai ch’ien-shih shou-shih kuei-lai;  
    ⑦ hsieh-tso wo-yu p’ing-fu.  

III Chang Chu (author)  

a) ① p’iao-miao hsien-shu;  
    ② lei-hsia yao-t’ai;  
    ③ tan-chu tung feng yen-se;  

b) ① lao-shu k’u-t’ai;  
    ② yu-yün ping-ch’uan;  
    ③ man-fu han-hsiang lang-chieh;  

It is possible to discover the minimal form of a particular line [of a ch’ü song]. Characters contained in the minimal form are called cheng-tzu. The characteristic pattern of a line is formed by the tone pattern of the cheng-tzu only. Characters may be added which do not underly the restrictions imposed by the tone pattern. These characters are called ch’en-tzu.  

56 Chang Yen, Shan-chung pai-yün, chüan 2, p. 5b.  
57 Ch’en Yün-p’ing, Ji-hu yü-ch’ang, p. 3a.  
58 Chang Chu, Tui-yen tz’u, chüan shang, p. 10a.
IV Songs to the melody an-hsiang

Lines by Chiang K'uei are marked a) \textsuperscript{50}, by Wu Wen-ying b) \textsuperscript{50}, by Chang Yen c) \textsuperscript{61}, by Wu Ch'ien d) \textsuperscript{62},

\begin{enumerate}
  \item a) \textit{wei-shuang} ch'ia-hu meng-lung yüeh;
  \textit{keng} mo-mo \textit{ming-yen} ti-ko;
  \item b) \textit{mo-ch'i}h hsüeh-ling ch'un ch'ang hao;
  \textit{ch'iao} pu-kuan hsiao-lou heng-ti;
  \item a) \textit{hen} ts'u-ch'in \textit{t'i-ch'u} ching-ts'an;
  \textit{i-yeh} meng-yün wu-chi.
  \item b) \textit{p'a} you-jen \textit{wu-jen} chen-hua;
  yü tien hsiao-lai chuang-e.
\end{enumerate}

\textsuperscript{50} CHIANG K'uei, \textit{Pai-shih tao-jen ko-chü}, chüan 5, 3b.
\textsuperscript{50} Wu Wen-ying, \textit{Meng-ch'uang tz'u}, p. 49b.
\textsuperscript{61} CHANG Yen, ibid., chüan 2, p. 12b.
\textsuperscript{62} Wu Ch'ien, \textit{Lü-chai}, pieh-chi, chüan 1, p. 6a.
b) ⑨ chin huan-ch'üeh wu-shuei wu-yen;
⑩ t'ao-li chien ch'un-mien;
c) ⑩ tan ch'en-i'a tou-ts'ao ch'ou-hua;
⑩ chung-shih tai-li-so;
d) ⑩ shang chi-te tsui-wo tung-yüan;
⑩ t'ien-mu ti wei hsi;
a) ⑩ chiang-kuo;
⑩ cheng chi-ching;
⑩ t'an chi-yü lu-yao;
b) ⑩ i-tso;
⑩ keng chi'ing e;
⑩ man jen-che mei-hua;
d) ⑩ hui-shou;
⑩ wang-shih chi;
⑩ cheng yü-an wu-hun;
a) ⑩ yeh-hsüeh ch'u-chi;
⑩ ts'ui-tsun i-ch'i;
b) ⑩ wo-chiang p'ing-t'ieh;
⑩ juan-hung lu-chieh;
c) ⑩ shih chün huan-ts'o;
⑩ shih-ch'uang leng-lo;
d) ⑩ wan-chung ch'ou-chi;
⑩ chin-chiang lu-ch'iao;
a) ⑩ hung-e wu-yen keng-hsiang-i;
b) ⑩ t'u-fen wei-shen tsao ts'ui-ju;
c) ⑩ hsien-sao sung-yin yü shui cho;
d) ⑩ mei-p'ing yin-ch'en liang k'ung-i;
a) ⑩ ch'ang-chi ts'eng-hsi shou-ch'u;
⑩ ch'ien-shu ya hsi-hu han-pi;
b) ⑩ hua-juan t'ien-hsiang yen-kuo;
⑩ hua-tui ts'u ch'ing-hsüan yin-la;
c) ⑩ i-tzu p'iao-ling ch'ü-yüan;
⑩ chi wu-liao teng-ch'ien shen-yüe;
d) ⑩ chung-shih mao-yen chu-hu;
⑩ nan chih-wang ling-yen chin-pi;
a) ⑩ yu p'ien-p'ien ch'ui chin ye;
⑩ chi-shih chien-te;
b) ⑩ keng wen-hsün hu-shang liu;
⑩ liang-ti ts'ui-lien;
c) ⑩ tsung tao-tz'u kui wei te;
⑩ chi-ts'eng wang-ch'üeh;
d) ⑩ ch'iao-ts'ui liao chiang-kuan li;
⑩ yüan shui shih-te.
In the sixth line of the second part of Chang Yen's song to the melody shu-ying 'te'\(^{[45]}\) is a ts'e-sheng instead of the required p'ing-sheng. It is my suggestion that this is perhaps an early example of a phenomenon of looseness in the use of tones in seven character lines the basic part of which consists in the last group of four characters\(^{[46]}\). Finally, Ch'en Yün-p'ing's shu-ying follows in the third lines of both halves the pattern set by Chiang K'uei. However, in the third position of the third line of the second half (b) a ts'e-sheng 'shih'\(^{[47]}\) is chosen instead of Chiang's p'ing-sheng. This only proves that even Ch'en who followed Chiang more closely than the other poets is aware of the possibility of an optional tone in this position! Under IV on the previous page the tone patterns of texts on the melody an-hsiang\(^{[48]}\) by four different poets are arranged in the same way as above. The inconsistencies found there are largely self-explanatory after what has been said about the songs shu-ying and ts'ui-lou-yin. As to the p'ing-sheng 't'a'\(^{[49]}\) in the eighth line of the song by Chang Yen I am prone to suggest the same interpretation as for the sixth line of the second part of Chang Yen's song to the melody shu-ying (see above). According to common punctuation practice the first two lines of the second half of an-hsiang are not considered as one five character line. In terms of tone patterns this makes perfect sense since the resulting pattern would be \(x 1 . 1 x 1\); very much against all conventions of Chinese classical versification.

An analysis of inconsistent choice of tones in Chiang K'uei's ts'ui indicates the essential role of the division between important and unimportant positions, a typical characteristic of chin-t'i shih versification; this is corroborated by the predominance of lü-chü patterns in five and seven characters lines. But also in lines constructed on the basis of units of two characters only the predominant pattern is achieved through the alternation of tone classes of the second character of each unit \(x - / x 1 / x -\) or \(x 1 / x - / x 1\). (\(x\) stands for a not-prescribed tone class). This pattern is obviously related to the pattern in part B of a lü-chü, in particular the pattern of the first four characters of a seven character lü-chü. Similarly, in seven character lines where the caesura follows after the third character \(O O O / O O O\) (not to be confused with the structure of a seven character lü-chü) the latter part of the line still tends to follow the pattern of part B of a lü-chü, and more often than not the tone class of the last character of the initial group of three characters tends to contrast with the tone class of the fifth character. In other words, the pattern of such a line may be formally written as either.

\[x x 1 / x - / x 1 ,\text{ or } x x - / x 1 / x - .\]

In both forms the strong influence of chin-t'i shih versification is obvious. These inconsistencies referred to above raise a very difficult problem: if there was considerable licence in the choice of tones in unimportant positions, what were the aesthetic consequences? Or else, why was such an inconsistency not regarded as "unharmonious?" One may think of some

\(^{[45]}\) I observed this phenomenon in the seventh and eighth lines of the hsiao-ling melody che-kuei-ling\(^{[46]}\) (Radyke, Yuan San-chü, 157ff).
modern chanting techniques mentioned above in which contrasts between
different tone classes were expressed only in certain positions. Without
supporting evidence this remains a matter for speculation. Perhaps more
likely an explanation may be found in the passage Shen Chih-pai quoted in
order to question the validity of musical analyses on the basis of scores:
"A p'ing (level) tune and a t's'e (deflected) syllable are not irreconcilable,
first utter the word and then return to the tune." This means that in positions
where the melodic movement is "level" p'ing a t's'e-sheng can be adapted for
singing by first enunciating the syllable and then expressing the tonal contour.

P'ing-t's'e or Szu-sheng

It seems that certain differences between shih and tz'u versification de­
veloped as a result of language changes between the T'ang and Sung dynasties.
These differences were only noticeable in the Sung dynasty, especially the
Southern Sung. They are most obvious in differences in the use of rhyme,
especially in the coalescence of the ju-sheng finals -p, -t, -k. It is well
known that even in chin-l'i shih rhyming practices were not as uniform as
poetical treatises might demand, yet these irregularities are insignificant
in number as compared with unorthodox rhyming in tz'u of the Sung dynasty.
Apart from the coalescence of -p, -t, and -k, nasal finals start to be used
interchangeably, especially -n and -m, less so -ng. Later, in the Chung-yüan
yin-yün, a prescriptive ch'ü rhyme dictionary from the Yüan dynasty, total
interchangeability of -p, -t, -k finals was recognized for the ch'ü genre where­
as the division between the nasal finals was maintained. This difference is
most probably due to the fact that the changes mentioned for the tz'u took
place in songs the versification of which was partially, at least, based on some
southern dialects, in contrast with the system of the Chung-yüan yin-yün,
which represents a northern dialect.

94 Ts'ü-yüan shu-cheng, 69.
95 SAkAI Kenichi, Sōshi ōin, 92 ff.; ogawa Tamaki, So Tōba, 846—7, and note 4.1.
on p. 861.
96 WANG Li, Han-yü shih-lü hsüeh, esp. 43 ff.; Pulleyblank, Li Ho, passim; Hsiu
Shih-ying, Lun Yüan Chen yung-yün; see also ogawa Tamaki, So Tōba, 848, and
861, note 1. Cf. Pulleyblank, Late Middle Chinese, 204: "... the rhyming of ninth­
century poets such as Li Ho and Po Chü-i who were uninhibited by lü-shih canons
accords with the rhyme groups (she) of the rhyme tables."
97 SAkAI Kenichi, Sōshi ōin, 102 ff.
98 One has to await future studies on the actual use of rhyme in Sung tz'u accor­
ding to the dialects various writers based themselves on. Cf. Suih Ming, Ts'ü-t'ung
(lun yün) esp. 34 ff. I am not sure whether a draft on tz'u rhymes mentioned by Lo
Hsin-t'ien (Ts'ao-ch'uang) was ever published. See also ogawa Tamaki, So Tōba,
852—3; on p. 856 he refers to basic problems in this approach. See also SAkAI Kenichi,
Sōshi ōin, 111. The approach by CH'en Hung-chih (Ts'ü-hsieh chin-lun, 106 ff.) is too
superficial. Cf. Cheng Ch'ien, Ts'ung shih t'ao ch'ü, 68. It may be excused if I omit
earlier scholars. The easiest way to analyze shifts in ju-sheng finals is, of course,
to analyze texts of those melodies which require a ju-sheng, such as tan-teng-yün,
tan-hung-liu, leng-shuang-ko, hao-shih-chin a. o. It may also be fruitful
to include tz'u from the Yüan dynasty (or even later) into such an analysis.
The proximity of tz’u and ch’ü rhyming was already noticed by Chu I-tsun (1629—1709)\(^{60}\); perhaps more important than changes in rhyming were certain shifts in the treatment of tones and tone classes. Neither Chu I-tsun nor a number of other scholars presented clear answers to the question whether in tz’u versification the traditional division into two tone classes was still predominant, or whether all tones were judged on their individual characteristics in "harmonizing" speech tones and melodic movement. An influential critic, Wang Sen\(^{64}\), put it this way:

"When we come to the melodies chiang-nan and ts’ai-lien\(^{65}\) of the Six Dynasties, [the technique of writing] is not far from [choosing words] according to the tone. The reason why it did not become tz’u was that the four tones were not as yet harmonized."

One must conclude that according to Wang the four individual tones were all-important in tz’u versification right from its very inception.

Not all scholars share this opinion\(^ {71}\). Below I will formulate my hypothesis on this matter:

In tz’u as well as in ch’ü versification one has to distinguish between two different sets of prescriptions:

a) The lü-chü or ao-chü patterns formulated in terms of p’ing and ts’e tone classes, and

b) additional prescriptions concerning individual tones, usually pertaining to a rather limited number of positions in a given tz’u or ch’ü melody only\(^ {72}\).

---

\(^{60}\) Chu I-tsun, Tz’u-tsung, section Fa-fan, p. 8.

\(^{70}\) Wang Sen, preface to the Tz’u-tsung, p. 1. This question is only concerned with tone patterns within a line, i.e. exclusive of the rhyming syllable, which can only be chosen from characters with the same tone. Wang Ch’in-hsi (Sung-tz’u, esp. 141,157) is quite correct in stating that the distinction between shang and ch’ü tones in tz’u poetry prepares the ground for ch’ü versification; contrary to his claim they were not generally distinguished in tz’u versification. See also the discussion between Chang Shih-pin and Hsia Ch’eng-t’ao (Chang Shih-pin, Lun T’ang Sung tz’u, passim, and Lun Sung-tz’u, 12; Hsia Ch’eng-t’ao, T’ang Sung tz’u, esp. 8ff., 53ff.). Against Hsia, I agree with Chang and Yang Hua (Yung szu-sheng, 133) that one cannot go so far as to claim that all four tones were as a rule distributed individually. I even doubt whether a comprehensive survey would support Lung Mu-hsün’s claim (Tz’u-lü chih-i, 7) that since Chang Yen tz’u poets started to distinguish between the four tones. Liang Ch’i-hsün goes even further and claims that not only four, but five tones were distinguished! (Tz’u-hsüeh ch’üan-heng, 52) Cf. also Cheng Ch’ien, Ts’ung shih tao ch’ü, 58. According to Cheng, choice of individual tones was confined to certain positions; this practice should have started at the beginning of the Southern Sung dynasty. Finally I would like to mention Liang Ch’i-hsün’s rather extreme view that in tz’u poetry the ch’ü-sheng contrasts with the remaining tones as the p’ing-sheng contrasts in chin-t’i shih versification with the ts’e tone class (Tz’u-hsüeh ch’üan-heng, 58).

\(^{71}\) Wang Sen, preface to the Tz’u-tsung, p. 1: "In the period of the Six Dynasties... the four tones were not yet harmonized."

\(^{72}\) This is largely based on Cheng Ch’ien’s opinion (Ts’ung shih tao ch’ü, 58). According to Cheng, choice of individual tones was confined to certain positions in the tz’u and southern ch’ü genres. This practice should have started at the beginning of the Southern Sung dynasty. I do however not share his views on the importance of initials for the versification of northern ch’ü, ibid.
The proof of the reasonability of this hypothesis requires a detailed case study. I carried this out at least for the ch'ü on a sample of approximately 500 hsiao-ling, and further random checks made this hypothesis also appear acceptable for the tz'u. Similar to the change in rhyming practices which has its basis in changes of the language one may suppose that other important changes in the versification of a genre or in poetry generally are often the outcome of language changes as well. Until now I have found no evidence for phonetic changes which may have caused an occasional distinction between individual tones in tz'u and ch'ü versification.

It was already mentioned that at times, a particular speech tone could be modified so that it became acceptable in a position requiring a different tone; it must be admitted that if this was actually common practice there is hardly any way to trace aesthetic effects of "irregular" tone patterns or to arrive at an independent evaluation of songs on the basis of characteristic metrical features. It seems to me that at present we are not (yet?) able to include this aspect (of regular and irregular tone patterns) in aesthetic evaluations of songs, although one may of course note that those writers whom one may call 'traditional', 'classicistic' or the like show a marked preference for the more 'regular' forms. When it comes to the artistic realization of those songs, however, we cannot do more than guess the artistic implications of various tone patterns.

Ao-chü

Besides the dominating lü-chü there do appear lines in tz'u and ch'ü poetry which do not follow the basic laws of chin-t'i shih versification. The discovery of such ao-chü is one of the first tasks one has to face in the study of metrical patterns of a new melody. Although one may argue about the existence of important and unimportant positions in such lines, it seems reasonable to dispense with a systematic discussion and describe them from case to case.

The Tz'u as a Genre

There are two general ways in which a genre can be defined, either by referring to "content" or to "form". A typical example of genres of the
first kind is the distinction between “lyric”, “epic” and “dramatic” genres\textsuperscript{78}. Other genres, like sonnet or \textit{Stabreim}\textsuperscript{79}, are primarily defined by formal characteristics. Neither of these concepts provides sufficient criteria by which these genres are unambiguously separated. References to differences in form between \textit{shih} and \textit{tz’u} are not sufficient, since there do exist melodies with formal patterns identical with those of \textit{lü-shih}, for instance\textsuperscript{80}. On the other hand, a poet like Su Shih was known for the adoption of a style typical for \textit{shih} in his \textit{tz’u} compositions\textsuperscript{81}. In seeking ways to distinguish between the \textit{shih} and the \textit{tz’u} one has to look for extraneous factors. Such a factor may exist in the different type of musical performance of \textit{shih} and \textit{tz’u} poetry. There are indications that the development of the \textit{chin-t’i shih}, especially in its \textit{chüeh-chü} variety, was closely connected with music, more specifically with Turkish folk-songs\textsuperscript{82}. In general, it seems that during the Tang and Sung dynasty poems were chanted or sung rather than “read”\textsuperscript{83}. Strictly speaking, one can thus not distinguish between \textit{shih} and \textit{tz’u} by referring to \textit{tz’u} as “poems for singing” or the like. I suspect that the division which was customarily made between \textit{chin-t’i shih} and \textit{tz’u} even in those cases where the versification patterns were alike had its root in differences in the musical realization of both genres\textsuperscript{84}. If this is so one wonders why the melody \textit{liu-ch’ing-niang}\textsuperscript{85} was commonly not included among lists of \textit{tz’u} melodies, although it exhibits characteristics of other \textit{tz’u} melodies\textsuperscript{86}. It is dubbed a “vulgar” song, \textit{su-ch’ü} by Wu Tse-yü\textsuperscript{86}.

\textit{shuang-sheng tieh-yün}\textsuperscript{87}, \textit{shan-ma-chieh}\textsuperscript{88}, and \textit{liu-ch’ing-niang} are all names from the \textit{yüan-pen ming-mu}\textsuperscript{89} (catalogue of \textit{yüan-pen} titles).

They are not encountered in Sung-\textit{tz’u} or \textit{ta-ch’ü} from the Sung; after having been used in the \textit{Liu Chih yüan chu-kung-tiao} they became later on \textit{pei-ch’ü}\textsuperscript{90} melodies\textsuperscript{87}.\textsuperscript{90}

\textsuperscript{78} Tomaszewski, \textit{Kratki kurs poetiki}, 119 ff.
\textsuperscript{79} Lehmann, \textit{Germanic Verse form}, esp. 3 ff.
\textsuperscript{81} Ch’eng I-chung, \textit{Tung-p’o tz’u ti i-ching}; see also Nakata Natsuki, \textit{Shi shi kyoku no setten}, 27, Lung Mu-hsun, \textit{Ta-ho shan-jen tz’u-hua}, 144.
\textsuperscript{82} Ogawa Tamaki, \textit{The Song of Ch’ih-le}, passim.
\textsuperscript{83} Feng-yüeh t’ang shih-hua, chüan hsia, 4a; Chou Ts’un, \textit{Tu Fu — jui-che-ku tz’u k’ao}, to mention only two among many other sources.
\textsuperscript{84} I wonder in how far one may speak about the “sound of classical poetry”; cf. Stimson, \textit{The Sound of a Tang poem}. Even in nonchanted poetry the realization of the sound of a poem by reading is to a considerable extent dependent on one’s personal interpretation of prosodic and metrical features etc.
\textsuperscript{85} Tun-huang ch’ü chiao-lu, 18 ff. According to Feng Yuan-chun, \textit{Ku-chü shuo-hui}, 310 it is not a \textit{tz’u} melody; there are, however, \textit{ch’ü} melodies carrying the same name. Their structure is different from the Tun-huang song (cf. \textit{T’ai-ho Cheng-yin} p’u, 124, and Chiu-kung \textit{ta-ch’eng}, chüan 13, 30b).
\textsuperscript{86} Wu Tse-yü, \textit{Chu-kung-tiao}, 281.
\textsuperscript{87} I do not want to deal with the question what \textit{yüan-pen} actually are. Such lists can be found in T’an Cheng-pi, \textit{Hua-pen yü ku-chü}. On \textit{ta-ch’ü}\textsuperscript{91} se Mei Ying-yün, \textit{Tz’u-tiao yü ta-ch’ü}.

81 Cf. Chou Kuo-tsan, \textit{Lun tz’u ti pen-se}, esp. 2 ff.
82 Ogawa Tamaki, \textit{The Song of Ch’ih-le,} passim.
83 Feng-yueh \textit{t’ang shih-hua,} \textit{chuan hsia,} 4a; Chou Ts’un, \textit{Tu Fu — jui-che-ku tz’u k’ao,} to mention only two among many other sources.
84 I wonder in how far one may speak about the “sound of classical poetry”; cf. Stimson, \textit{The Sound of a Tang poem}. Even in nonchanted poetry the realization of the sound of a poem by reading is to a considerable extent dependent on one’s personal interpretation of prosodic and metrical features etc.
85 Tun-huang ch’ü chiao-lu, 18 ff. According to Feng Yuan-chun, \textit{Ku-chü shuo-hui}, 310 it is not a \textit{tz’u} melody; there are, however, ch’ü melodies carrying the same name. Their structure is different from the Tun-huang song (cf. \textit{T’ai-ho Cheng-yin} p’u, 124, and Chiu-kung \textit{ta-ch’eng}, chüan 13, 30b).
87 I do not want to deal with the question what \textit{yüan-pen} actually are. Such lists can be found in T’an Cheng-pi, \textit{Hua-pen yü ku-chü}. On \textit{ta-ch’ü} se Mei Ying-yün, \textit{Tz’u-tiao yü ta-ch’ü}.

---

\textsuperscript{56} 柳青娘 \textsuperscript{57} 雙聲疊韻 \textsuperscript{58} 山麻皆 \textsuperscript{59} 院本名目
\textsuperscript{60} 北曲 \textsuperscript{61} 大曲
Jen Chung-min noticed that the melody liu-ch'ing-niang has the same overall structure as the tz'u melody yu-chia-ao but a different tone pattern. In such a case, the problem of finding unambiguous criteria to distinguish between the tz'u and other genres seems unsolvable. For practical reasons one will have to content oneself by calling tz'u those and only those melodies which are designated as such in tz'u anthologies such as the Huo-chien chi, the Chüeh-miao hao-tz'u and others. Apart from the tz'u there existed during the Yüan dynasty a variety of different genres of song-poems, such as the ch'ang-chuan or the chu-kung-tiao. In spite of efforts by scholars such as Wang Kuo-wei, Cheng Chen-to, or Feng Yüan-chü the whole problem of the evolution, development, and cross-influences among these genres is far from being solved.

On the whole one may notice that in almost all cases ch'ü melodies consist of one part (tuan) only, as compared with tz'u melodies which may consist of one or more parts. This prompted several scholars to claim that a sequence of tz'u songs by Yang Wan-li (1124—1206) was a forerunner of the ch'ü because in this sequence one observes tz'u melodies from which the latter half has been omitted.

A Fragment of a Chü Score?

The Shih-lin kuang-chi contains scores of some melodies. One score in particular, that of the melody yuän-ch'eng-shuang ling, may throw an interesting light on the relationship between tz'u and ch'ü melodies. A melody with a similar name, yuän-ch'eng-shuang, appears at the beginning of some extant t'ao-shu from the Yüan dynasty. Below follows a copy of

---

88 See Tz'u-lü, chúan 9, 227.
89 Tun-huang chü chiao-tu, 18 ff. The term 'overall structure' refers to the pattern determined by the number of lines, character per lines, and the position of the caesura.
90 Wang Kuo-wei, Sung Yüan hsi-ch'ü shih, esp. 39 ff.; Cheng Chen-to, Chung-kuo su wen-hsüeh shih, esp. part II, 1 ff.; Cheng Chen-to, Chu-kung-tiao, passim; Ch'en Chung-lan, Yüan-chü yen-chü, e.g. 83. See also Feng Yüan-chü's very well annotated essays in Ku-chü shuo-hui, esp. 121 ff., 230 ff. Some of the most important sources on these genres are listed in Pian, Song Sources, esp. 41-2. Chen Li-li's article Chu-kung-tiao contains no new material on the development of this form in connection with related forms. Buddhist popular songs of that period received comparatively less attention: see Choü I-pai, Ch'ang-lun chu-shih, 8; Fang Hao, Chung hsi chiao-t'ung shih, 160; Cheng Chen-to, Wen-hsüeh yen-chü, 1336.
91 Ye Te-chün, Sung Yüan Ming chüang-ch'ang wen-hsüeh, esp. 2; Wu Tse-yü, Shih-fan, 254 ff., 287.
92 Yang Wan-li, Ch'eng-ch'ai chi, chúan 97, p. 15b (Ch'eng-ch'ai kui-ch'ü-lai hsi yin). On this sequence, e.g. Chu Ch'ien-chih, Chung-kuo yin-yüeh wen-hsüeh shih, p. 209.
93 The Shih-lin kuang-chi is a text with a very difficult textual history containing extremely valuable material for the study of Chinese cultural history of the medieval ages; the edition used contains material concerning the Yüan dynasty.
95 On the form of the t'ao-shu, see below, p. 22. Such t'ao-shu may be found in Ch'üan Yüan san-ch'ü, 504, 1072, 1624, 1783.
the original score, side by side with the text of a specimen of a ch'ü text to the melody yüan-ch'eng-shuang:

As Pian pointed out the symbol / seems to suggest a kind of hold or rest; this is perfectly borne out by the division into lines of the accompanying ch'ü text. Pian was not sure about the circles appearing in the score. Judging from the song text they indicate caesuras within a line of text or a musical phrase. The structural identity between the score and the song text is so great that one will probably be not very wrong if one assumes that this score presents a partial score of a Yüan t'ao-shu melody — to be precise, only the first part of the original melody fits the song text. In other words, the score still reflects a structure known from the bisected type of tz'u

---

96 For the text by Lan Ch'u-tang, see Ch'üan Yüan san-ch'ü, 1624.
97 PIAN, Song Sources, 130. There she discusses some other technical problems concerning the interpretation of this score.
98 It should be noted that the circle in the third phrase indicates that this six-character line cum ling-tzu has its main caesura before the last four characters.
99 The overall appearance of the score suggest a syllabic and not a melismatic interpretation. Only in the fourth line of text are there more notes than syllables; it is possible that originally this line of text was supposed to consist of two units with each four characters. Compare also a song written by Yüan Hao-wen (1190—1257) to the melody Tsou-yü ta hsing-he [67]. There is, in fact, only one "ch'ü" song to this melody which in every respect but its name is identical with the tz'u melody hsiao-sheng-le [68]! Chu Ch'üan very logically omitted the second part of the melody in the T'ai-ho cheng-yin p'u which concentrates on ch'ü melodies (Ch'üan Yüan san-ch'ü, p. 3, and T'ai-ho cheng-yin p'u, 161—162).
melodies whereas the second part was omitted when this melody was adapted to the ch'ü genre (the Chinese characters towards the end of the score imply that the whole piece had to be repeated, yet with a different initial line (huan-t'ou), from the sign wang-hsia onwards).

**Tz'u and Ch'ü: Two Separate Genres?**

The confusion that reigns in Chinese (and foreign) scholarship with regard to the terms tz'u and ch'ü as names for independent, separate genres can perhaps be illustrated by referring to the opinion of two scholars on ch'en-tzu in tz'u and ch'ü. According to Lo K'ang-lieh ch'en-tzu are not uncommon even in the early tz'u genre\(^{100}\). Chou I-pai asserts that ch'ü and tz'u are distinguished by the absence of ch'en-tzu in the latter\(^{101}\). As in the case of shih and tz'u there are ch'ü melodies which are formally identical with tz'u melodies so that general definitions about differences between the two genres are very difficult, if not impossible, to find\(^{102}\). The uncertainty about the classification of some melodies as either belonging to the tz'u or ch'ü genres is a further indication for the vaqueness of the boundaries between tz'u and ch'ü\(^{103}\).

The Missing Link Between Tz'u and Ch'ü

Whereas one can observe a gradual development of tz'u melodies from early melodies formally close to chin-t'i shih to the more intricate man-tz'u, for instance, extant manuscripts of ch'ü texts give the impression of a very sudden rise of the ch'ü genre, with sub-genres tsä-chü, t'ao-shu\(^{173}\), and hsiao-ling, among which the tsä-chü had right from its beginning a well organized and fixed complex structure. Formally speaking, the hsiao-ling consists of a song text to one melody (more seldom some fixed combination of two or even three melodies) from a restricted sample of hsiao-ling melodies. A t'ao-shu consists of song-texts to various melodies from a sample of t'ao-shu melodies. The arrangement of various t'ao-shu melodies to form a unit underlies certain rules, and while some melodies appear both as hsiao-ling and t'ao-shu melodies, it has to be kept in mind that hsiao-ling melodies cannot be freely combined to form t'ao-shu, nor can a melody from a t'ao-shu invariably be used independently as a hsiao-ling melody. While the tsä-chü is often translated as 'opera', it is formally best described as a combination of

---

100 Lo K'ang-lieh, T'ien-tz'u ch'en-tzu shih-li, esp. 17ff.
101 Chou I-pai, Ch'ang-lun chu-shih, 44: 'With regard to its literary form, the difference between tz'u and ch'ü lies in the absence or presence of ch'en-tzu.'
102 Lo K'ang-lieh, Pei hsiao-ling wen-tzu p'u, p. 1 jen-yüeh-yüan, kan-ts'ao-tzu, p. 18: the form of these (and numerous other) melodies is identical whether they are classified as tz'u or as ch'ü.
103 In Wang Yün's (1228–1304) collected works (as well as in the collected works of some other writers) ch'ü melodies can be found, although not treated separately and mixed with other tz'u melodies (Ch'üan Yüan san-ch'ü, tzu-hsü, p. 3). Cf. Chu I-tsun, Tz'u-tsung Fa-fan, p. 7.
t'ao-shu accompanied by dialogues as well as monologues. We know very little about the actual performance of these genres. While it is clear that the tsa-chü was (also?) performed on a stage, it is quite surprising to notice that we know very little about the way in which t'ao-shu and hsiao-ling could be performed, in private circles or perhaps also occasionally on the stage, by poets themselves, by entertainers, and whether musical accompaniment was customary for the performance of hsiao-ling and t'ao-shu just as it seems to have been the case with the tsa-chü.

Among extant sources one will look in vain for direct predecessors of the ch'ü genre as a whole, which could provide a "missing link", not only between the ch'ü and the tz'u, but perhaps also other genres. In spite of efforts by numerous scholars the precise story about the development of the Yüan-ch'ü is not yet known. It seems, however, that recent archeological discoveries enable us to give an earlier date for the origin of the stage-drama than scholars who based themselves on written sources were prepared to suggest. This does not necessarily mean that Yüan-ch'ü — in particular tsa-chü — must also have been in existence at such an early date. It is not unreasonable to assume that Yüan drama developed along the same lines as the chu-kung-tiao. While the early chu-kung-tiao genre makes large use of tz'u and tz'u-type melodies the later specimens draw almost exclusively on ch'ü melodies. To put it differently, the type of melody used in the chu-kung-tiao does not form an essential characteristic of that genre. It is rather its structure that joins a number of t'ao-shu with interspersed passages to form a greater whole that gives the chu-kung-tiao its typical features. Once it is recognized that Yüan drama could have developed similarly one need not longer try to adhere to assumptions as those made by Lo Chin-t'ang who claimed that the larger forms tsa-chü and t'ao-shu must have developed after the smaller hsiao-ling had been created. Lo's assumption seems quite self-contradictory, since he also claims the close connection between the

---

104 Among many other hypotheses I will only mention YOSHIKAWA Kōjirō's opinion that the basis for the songs employed in tsa-chü and san-ch'ü would have been laid during the reign of the emperor Chang-tsung (1190–1208) of the Chin dynasty (1115–1234) (Gen zatsugeki no chōshū, 333). I suspect that an institution like the mu-fu may have acted as one of the cultural centres contributing to the growth of the ch'ü as well. At the mu-fu (Japanese bakufu) the various military leaders gathered scholars and let them carry out various cultural activities. Among them were famous scholars like YÜAN Hao-wen and YAO Sui (1238–1314) who played an important part in the preservation of scholarship, knowledge of rites, mainly from the Chin dynasty, and in the introduction of Neo-Confucian scholarship to the north. It is not unreasonable to suspect that 'lighter' arts such as the ch'ü might have received attention at these cultural centers as well. On the cultural importance of the mu-fu, see ASE Takeo, Gendai Chishikijin; YÜAN Kuo-fan, Tung-p'ing Yen-shih. Cf. also SUAN K'e-k'uan, Yüan-tai, 121 ff. There a considerable number of artists and musicians had found refuge and it may easily have been one of the centres of the development of the early ch'ü.

105 See TING Ming-i, Sung Yüan wu-t'ai; HSÜ P'ing-fang, Tsa-chü tiao-ch'uan; CHAO Ching-shen, Pei Sung ti tsa-chü tiao-ch'uan, 230–6.

106 YEH Teh-chün, Sung Yüan Ming ch'iang-ch'ang wen-hsüeh, esp. 2, and WU Tse-yü, Shih-t' an, 254 ff., 287.

107 Lo Chin-t'ang, Chung-kuo san-ch'ü shih, 21.
much earlier chu-kung-tiao and the later drama to have been of decisive influence in the development of the ch'ü. Must one assume that the chu-kung-tiao first fostered the growth of the hsiao-ling, which then developed again into more complex forms as the t'ao-shu and the ts'a-ch'ü? In the opinion of the present writer, another hypothesis appears to be more promising: the structure and form of the drama, song-sequence (t'ao-shu) and single song need not necessarily be confined to a particular genre such as the ch'ü. These forms existed before the ch'ü style — a musical style — came into prominence. However, once the new musical ch'ü style won widespread acceptance its songs and melodies started to dominate the existing forms, while each sub-genre (tsa-chü, t'ao-shu, hsiao-ling) retained its structural characteristics. This is in fact the picture one sees in the development of the chu-kung-tiao! One will perhaps never be able to find out what the typical characteristics of that new ch'ü (musical) style were: one may assume that the omission of the second part of some tz'u melodies which were adapted to the ch'ü genre was due to a different musical structure of the ch'ü. It would be beyond the scope of this paper to attempt a (partial) verification of the hypothesis advanced above on the basis of a comparative study of the origin of the respective melodies. It is well known, however, that quite a number of hsiao-ling melodies never appear in t'ao-shu and vice versa, which in my view is an indication for a rather separate development of the sub-genres t'ao-shu and hsiao-ling.

Nan-ch'ü and Pei-ch'ü — Southern and Northern Ch'ü

This paper dealing with genres more or less related to the ch'ü would not be complete without referring, at least in a cursory way, to the division between the southern and northern ch'ü styles. Such divisions between northern and southern styles abound in the history of Chinese art, whether in painting, music, or in poetry. In the context of Yüan-ch'ü this division seems to refer to quite specific distinctions between a northern and a southern musical style. In early critical writings the most systematic comparison between both styles is found in Wang Chi-te's (-1623) Ch'ü-lü:

"The North emphasizes forcefulness, the South softness; in the northern style there are more syllables and the melody proceeds rapidly, ... in the southern style there are fewer syllables and the melody proceeds slowly ... The force of the northern style lies in the use of stringed instruments, the force of the southern style in the rhythm-indicating percussion instruments. ... as far as choice of initials and versification are concerned, they differ completely."

References to different northern and southern styles are already found in sources from the Yüan dynasty itself, such as the Ch'io-keng lu and the

---

109 See e.g. Chu Ch'ien-chih, Chung-kuo yin-yüeh wen-hsueh shih, 209.
110 A future detailed analysis of differences in the development of hsiao-lind and t'ao-shu melodies will be greatly aided by Yen Ting-i's list of melodies indicating their origin (Yüan-chen chü-tiao shuo-yüan).
111 See the various tables in Wang Ching-ch'ang, Ch'ü-hsueh ii-shih, 27 ff.
112 Wang Chi-teh, Ch'ü-lü, p. 57. The translation is not a literal one.
Neither Wang Chi-te's relatively late comments nor other sources seem to contain satisfactory, i.e. sufficient criteria to distinguish between both styles as preserved in the song texts. One may, after all, suspect that the most important difference lay in the use of heptatonic scales in the northern and basically pentatonic scales in the southern ch'ü.

Sources like the Ch'ing-lou chi quoted above indicate that in the Yüan dynasty there existed a southern tradition of songs; in fact, Chou Te-ch'ing implied that the tradition of the Southern Sung had not completely died away during his lifetime. One may also point out that the nan-ch'ü shows features reminiscent of the tz'u of the Southern Sung which also suggests that the nan-ch'ü did not develop "on top" of the pei-ch'ü, but rather under the influence of the pei-ch'ü on the basis of earlier, southern style songs. In the first place, the number of tz'u melodies adapted to the ch'ü genre is higher in the nan-ch'ü than in the pei-ch'ü. Secondly, a feature as characteristic of the nan-ch'ü as the chi-chü hat its direct precursor in the man-tz'u of the Sung, itself a representative of the tz'u of the south. I observed, too, that generally speaking, the number of shorter lines is relatively higher in man-tz'u as well as in nan-ch'ü melodies. This may in fact be the phenomenon described by Wang Chi-te in the passage quoted above when he says that "in the northern [style], the [number of] characters is high . . . , in the southern [style], the [number of] characters is low." It should be stressed that in spite of the differences listed above it seems impossible to distinguish a northern and a southern song text on the basis of the text itself. For that purpose one has to rely on early compilations which contain separate lists of northern and southern melodies.

Text-Music Relationships in Tz'u and Ch'ü

An analytical study of melodic structure and melodic movement in Chiang K'uei's tz'u and selected k'un-ch'ü arias is extremely interesting but has to be

---

Ch'ing-lou chi. Neither Wang Chi-te's relatively late comments nor other sources seem to contain satisfactory, i.e. sufficient criteria to distinguish between both styles as preserved in the song texts. One may, after all, suspect that the most important difference lay in the use of heptatonic scales in the northern and basically pentatonic scales in the southern ch'ü.

Sources like the Ch'ing-lou chi quoted above indicate that in the Yüan dynasty there existed a southern tradition of songs; in fact, Chou Te-ch'ing implied that the tradition of the Southern Sung had not completely died away during his lifetime. One may also point out that the nan-ch'ü shows features reminiscent of the tz'u of the Southern Sung which also suggests that the nan-ch'ü did not develop "on top" of the pei-ch'ü, but rather under the influence of the pei-ch'ü on the basis of earlier, southern style songs. In the first place, the number of tz'u melodies adapted to the ch'ü genre is higher in the nan-ch'ü than in the pei-ch'ü. Secondly, a feature as characteristic of the nan-ch'ü as the chi-chü hat its direct precursor in the man-tz'u of the Sung, itself a representative of the tz'u of the south. I observed, too, that generally speaking, the number of shorter lines is relatively higher in man-tz'u as well as in nan-ch'ü melodies. This may in fact be the phenomenon described by Wang Chi-te in the passage quoted above when he says that "in the northern [style], the [number of] characters is high . . . , in the southern [style], the [number of] characters is low." It should be stressed that in spite of the differences listed above it seems impossible to distinguish a northern and a southern song text on the basis of the text itself. For that purpose one has to rely on early compilations which contain separate lists of northern and southern melodies.

Text-Music Relationships in Tz'u and Ch'ü

An analytical study of melodic structure and melodic movement in Chiang K'uei's tz'u and selected k'un-ch'ü arias is extremely interesting but has to be
relegated to a separate study. Within the limitations of this paper I have
opted for a different approach to demonstrate similarities in the text-music
relationship of both genres. An analysis of the distribution of signs indicating
rests, beats, prolonged notes, and liquescent neumes in Chiang K'uei's tz'u
shows that this distribution follows patterns which in turn can be related
to the metrical structure of the corresponding lines of the song texts. For the
sake of simplicity, I have selected lines with four, five, and seven characters
and indicated the frequency of appearance of neumes (N) and other signs
(S) which all refer to rests or (linear) prolongations in corresponding posi­
tions. These figures presented below are based on an analysis by Picken.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lines with four characters:</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lines with five characters:</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lines with seven characters:</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In my analysis of k'un-ch'ü I confined myself to a short piece only, a k'un-
ch'ü version of Ma Chih-yüan's (Yuan) t'ao-shu yeh-hsing-ch'uan. Because
of textual variants I decided to reproduce the notation as well as the text
of four, five, and seven character lines in this t'ao-shu.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>four-character lines</th>
<th>five-character lines</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>chin jih 56543</td>
<td>ch'un lai 5V654 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ming chao</td>
<td>hua hsieh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pu pien</td>
<td>lung she</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chu li</td>
<td>mao she</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>2221 765</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chin szu</td>
<td>hsia p'o ch'e</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>2 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p'ei kung</td>
<td>lü yeh t'ang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3 02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>t'ao ling</td>
<td>pai lian sheh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>he lu</td>
<td>che huang hua</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>102</td>
<td>35 6 543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tai shuang</td>
<td>p'eng tzu hisia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chu chiu</td>
<td>shao hung yeh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>506 543 2321</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

129 The present writer is not satisfied with earlier attempts (Pian, Song Sources,
36, and Picken, Secular Songs, 164). In k'un-ch'ü and — according to my own in­
vestigations — to some extent in CHIANG K'uei's tz'u it will often be extremely
difficult if not futile to define a melody in terms of "typical melodic movements"
between a fixed initial and final note. One of the reasons for this difficulty in the
k'un-ch'ü genre is the variability of a particular melody partly caused by musical
phrases which are commonly associated with individual speech tones (tzu-tiao [80]; see Yang Yin-liu, Chung-kuo yin-yüeh shih kang, 242 ff.). The far-reaching absence of greater intervals in CHIANG K'uei's nine songs for Yüeh has the effect of softening the melodic movement to such an extent that it seems more appropriate to define particular melodies in conjunction with the importance that specific notes obtain in the structure of a piece: these notes need not be identical with the cadencing notes. It seems to me that such a method will also be applicable in CHIANG K'uei's tzu'. In such a way, typical differences between CHIANG's composing techniques in the Yüeh songs and the secular songs will become more apparent. Without going into details it may be said that important notes need not be identical in songs written in the same mode. Cf. Picken, Chiang K'uei's Nine Songs for Yüeh. On a different approach to melodic analysis, e.g. Kakinoki Gorô, Kōzōshiki (see also his bibliography).

111 Picken, Secular Songs, 137. It should be noted that I do not agree with the punctuation in all song texts as given by Picken. In order to avoid an extremely tedious re-interpretation, I kept to this punctuation. Any changes would not have significantly influenced the results of this analysis.

112 Liu Chen-hsiu, K'un-ch'ü hsìn-tao, 1 ff.

113 A version with notes on variants is found in Ch'üan Yüan san-ch'ü 268 ff. The line in the middle of the columns indicates the main caesura.
In Chiang K’uei’s tz’u one notices the absence of any significant number of neumes in the final position of a line. In all types of lines neumes favour the penultimate position. In lines with five and seven characters neumes show a marked tendency towards appearing in the important positions 2, 4, and 6. As is to be expected signs indicating length or beats accumulate at the end of a line. No explanation will be attempted for the fact that they are also very numerous in the third position in five character lines. One notices that as a rule neumes favour those positions in which there are less “S” and vice versa.

In Ma Chih-yüan’s t’ao-shu one notices similar tendencies, particularly the absence of neumes from the final position as compared with position 3 in four character lines, and the penultimate position in seven character lines. This is however a tendency which is kept less rigidly than in Chiang K’uei’s tz’u. Signs for pauses and linear prolongations abound at the end of a line. In all types of lines from both genres one notices a progression in the number of “N” and “S” from the beginning towards the end of a line.

I want to avoid any impression that the scores on which this analysis is based were composed along the same lines in all respects. On the other hand one must realize that in both genres one observes this phenomenon of progressive complexity within a line, which to my mind is a reflection of an essential characteristic of lü-chü: within the first part of a line (of four characters in a seven character line) the number of optional tones is the highest whereas in the second part the choice of tones for the uneven characters underlies restrictions. The data and table provided here allow only for a very rough comparison. One problem that has not yet been solved is that of “inconsistent” use of speech tones in (almost) identical musical phrases, in particular, whether in k’un-ch’ü composing techniques one observes features similar to those found in Chiang K’uei’s tz’u. Without going into lengthy musical analyses I will present below some corresponding and very similar musical phrases from the k’un-ch’ü melody ch’ao-yüan-ko[81] together with the accompanying lines of text[124]:

(1)
ch’ang ch’ing   tuan ch’ing
1  2  3-   / 33 32 55 / 1-02

(2)
ching shen   lou shen
35 3-   / 03 23 35 32 / 1-02

(3)
ni shih ke   t’ien shengchün sheng
23 / 36 6 5 3 3 2 2 1 2 1 65


[81] 朝元歌

28
The first four phrases, phrases 5—8 and 9—11 are corresponding phrases from the melody ch’ao-yüan-ko. The tone pattern of the first type (lines 1—4) is: x — 1 — ; for the next four lines it is: x — x 1, and for the last three lines it is 1 1 — — . One may now have a look at optional tones: In the first four phrases ch’ang, ching, t’ien, and i belong to different tone classes, and the accompanying notes are: 1) 1 2 ; 2) 3 5 ; 3) 3 ; 4) 3 . One may now notice that musically spoken, phrases 1 and 2 belong closely together, in that they share the notes for the second character — and the fourth character 1 — 0 2. Likewise, phrases 3 and 4 are united in the use of 3·2 for the second and 1·2 1·6 5 for the fourth character. Although there are similarities in melodic structure for the other characters identical parts are restricted to positions two and four.

---

125 K’un-ch’ü hsin-tao, from the opera Yü-tsan chi, the famous section ch’in-t’iao [84] [pp. 58—66].
126 In one instance, difficulties in the structure of the line made it advisable to omit that line from the analysis.
127 In phrase 3 and 4 I assumed that ni shih ko [84] and t’ing t’a are ch’en-tzu.
Differences are much greater in the next group of four lines. However, a glance at the second and fourth positions shows the following group of notes:
For the second position: 3—/ 3 3 3; 2 3 / 3 3 3 2; 2 3 0 2; 3—.
For the fourth position: 5 5 3 2 1 2 1 6; 5 5 3 2 1 / ; 5 5 3 5 6 —; 3 2 1. Even without a detailed analysis some similarities are readily recognizable. There is also a considerable uniformity in the first position: 3 5; 1 3; 1 3; 3; yet not in the third position: 2 3; 1 2 3; 6 1 6; 2.

Finally, one will notice a high degree of coinciding musical phrases in the five character lines without optional tones. This is particularly conspicuous in phrases 9 and 10 (except for the first character). One may notice that at the end of the fourth characters chung and yün the melody converges on 2, 1 and then 6. In the tenth phrase this step is deferred until the first note of the next character shen. For some reason the length of phrase 11 is much reduced as compared with 9 and 10. In the last position, the movement from 5 to 3 is also present in phrases 9 and 10, and one will also notice the convergence of the melody to step 6, here in an ascending phrase. The notes 5 and 3 of the pre-penultimate character are also present in phrases 9 and 10, one may assume that there the note 2 is a transitional note leading to the lower 1 of the next characters. A similar phenomenon is encountered in the second position (it has been assumed that t'a is a ch'en-tzu). Only in the first character of phrase 9 are there considerable differences. This short survey must suffice here to show how an "irregular" four character line as well as four and five character lü-chü may have optional tones in certain positions of corresponding musical lines without that the "harmony" seems to have been destroyed in the music-text relationship. While keeping to some basic recognizable features the melody is flexible enough to allow for optional tones in certain positions.

The greatest difference between Chiang K'uei's tz'u and k'un-chü arias lies perhaps in the strong melismatic character of the latter. There are, however, scholars who suppose that the extant tz'u notations represent only an "outline" of the actually performed melody. I would not deny this possibility. The important point that seems to appear from an analysis of Chiang K'uei's tz'u and a brief comparison with k'un-chü arias is that the composing technique does not demand a strict parallelism between a fixed melodic movement and speech tones in all positions of a line. Although I have not particularly stressed that point it has to be added that lü-chü also play a con-

---

[86] 中，雲
[87] 深

---

I suspect that a full analysis will have to take into account changes similar to those observed by SCHÖNFELDER and PIAN in their studies on Peking opera, who have again turned attention to the role of melodic structure in Chinese operatic music (PIAN, Text Setting, and PIAN, Song Sources, 36 f., SCHÖNFELDER, Peking Oper). The tone patterns given here are based on a comparison of the text of the lines under consideration.
siderable role in *k'un-ch'ü* texts. There is only one good example for the role of optional tones in *k'un-ch'ü* versification in the lines quoted above (phrases 5—8). It is the opinion of the present writer that this problem, the role of fixed versification patterns in *k'un-ch'ü* texts and their relationship with the melodic and musical structure in general has not yet received the full attention of some specialists.

**Conclusion**

A brief historical survey of versification patterns in *shih*, *tz'u* and *ch'ü* showed the close formal relationship between these genres. It was moreover proven that the nature of versification techniques, as expressed in four basic laws of versification, was of major relevance to a proper understanding of the versification not only of the *shih*, but also of the *tz'u* and the *ch'ü*. A major obstacle to the recognition of the role of *chin-t'i* *shih* versification for the song genres *tz'u* and *ch'ü* was often thought to be the fact that speech tones in songs were chosen to harmonize in a very direct way with the melodic movements. In the absence of a significant amount of *ch'ü* scores from the *Yüan* dynasty I analyzed the relationship between versification patterns and melodic movement for a few specimens of *tz'u* and *k'un-ch'ü*. It appeared that the study of inconsistencies in the choice of tones in certain positions in different songs revealed that inconsistencies occurred mainly in those positions which could be designated 'unimportant' in terms of the basic versification laws of *chin-t'i* *shih*. However, no conclusion could be reached about the aesthetic consequences of this phenomenon. A preliminary investigation of *k'un-ch'ü* melodies and versification indicated that at least in that genre, traditional Western opinions about a melody fixed in all aspects would have to give way to a more flexible approach. Since we also know that melodies of Chinese folksongs are variable to a certain extent dependent on the text (or, versification) of the song it seems most reasonable to assume that 'melody' in Chinese art song in general is much more likely to be varied according to the demands of the text than perhaps a 'melody' in a different musical tradition. While this approach is not capable of giving specific insights into the nature of Yuan-ch'ü music, it certainly allows us to understand better why the 'rigid' patterns of *lû-chü* with fixed speech tones in certain positions could easily be maintained in the song texts of the *tz'u* and *ch'ü* genres.

At least one important conclusion will have to be drawn from this study for the problem of aesthetic evaluation of, e.g., the *Yüan-ch'ü*. In the absence of either a written or an oral tradition of *Yüan-ch'ü* melodies the song-texts themselves do not allow us any judgement about the harmony a certain versification pattern would achieve with the melody of that song. The very fact that a certain versification pattern is extremely frequent, can more often than not be adduced to the widespread tradition of *imitation* in China. The deviance from a versification pattern established by one of the masters will rather indicate a certain independent-mindedness from the strictures of tradition than a lack of musical harmony. A number of other, quite complex problems have to be dealt with before the problem of aesthetic evaluation
can be tackled, but it seems certain that any judgement of a ch’ü (or tz’u) song on its artistic merits on the grounds of its adherence to or deviance from the most frequent ‘standard’ versification pattern seems utterly unreasonable, especially in the absence of the music itself.\(^{129}\)

**Bibliography**

a) *Works in Western Languages*


Ch’ên, Li-li ‘Outer and Inner Forms of Chu-kung-tiao, with reference to P’ienwen, tz’u and Vernacular Fiction’ in *HJAS*, XXXII, 1972, 124–149.


---

\(^{129}\) The present writer has tried to work out several criteria which may — in combination — be useful for attempts at artistic evaluations of hsiao-ling of the Yüan dynasty. See RADTKE, Yuan Sanqu, esp. 213–373.


Pulleyblank, E. G. 'Late Middle Chinese' in *AM*, XV, 1969—70, 197—239.


b) Works in Chinese


Chang Shih-pin 'Lun Sung tz'u chih szu-sheng yin-yang' in *New Asia Life*, IV.5.


Chao Wan-li "San-chü ti li-shih kuan" in *Wen-hsüeh*, II.6, 1934, June 1, 1135—41.

Ch'en Ch'ung-fan *Chung-kuo yüen-wen t'ung-lun*, 1927 (1936.3 fourth edition).


Cheng Chen-to 'Sung Chin Yüan chu-kung-tiao k'ao' in *Yen-ching ta-hsüeh nien-pao*, I, Peking, 1932 (offprint).

Cheng Chen-to *Chung-kuo su wen-hsüeh shih*, Wen-hsüeh ku-chi, Peking, 1959.

Cheng Chen-to *Chung-kuo wen-hsüeh yen-chiu*, Tso-chia, Peking, 1957, 12.

Ch'eng Ch'ien *Ts'ung shih tao chü*, Wen-hsüeh ts'ung-shu, K'o-hsüeh, preface dated 1961.8.

Ch'eng I-chung "Tung-p'o tz'u ti i-ching" in *Wen-hsüeh i-ch'an*, no. 186 December 8, 1957.
Chiang K'uei *Pai-shih tao-jen ko-chü*, 6 chüan + 1 chüan supplement, Chiang-
ts'un ts'ung-shu ed.

Ch'iing-lou chi see Hsia T'ing-chih, Ch'iing-lou chi.

Chiu-kung ta-ch'eng pei-tz'u kung-p'u' in *Chiu-kung ta-ch'eng nanpei tz'u'
kung-p'u*, Chou Hsiang-yü comp., 81 chüan, Ku-shu liu-t'ung ch'u, Shanghai,
1923 (repr. of Ch'ien-lung nei-fu printed edition).

Chiu T'ang shu, Erh-shih wu-shih ed., 9 vols. + 1 vol index, Wen-hsüeh yen-
chiu she, Hong Kong, 1959.9.

Ch'iu Ch'iung-sun *Pai-shih tao-jen ko-ch'i t'ung-k'ao*, Chung-kuo yin-yüeh
yen-chiu-so ts'ung-k'an, Yin-yüeh, Peking, 1959.

Cho Ts'un 'Tu Fu jui-che-ku tz'u k'ao' in *Wen-shih II*, 1963.4, 170.

Ch'o-keng lu see T'ao Tsung-yi Ch'o-keng lu.

Chou Fa-kao 'Shuo p'ing-ts'e' in *Li-shih yü-yen yen-chiu so chi-k'an*, XIII,
1948, 153—162.

Chou I-pai 'Ch'ang-lun chu-shih', in *Hsi-ch'ü yen-ch'ang lun-chu chu-shih*,

Chou Kuo-ts'an 'Lun tz'u ti pen-se chi ch'i i-pan piao-hsien fa' in *Chung-kuo

Chou Te-ch'ing *Chung-yüan yin-yün*, Chung-kuo ku-tien hsi-chü lun-chu

Chu Ch'ien-chih *Chung-kuo yin-yüeh wen-hsüeh shih*, Shang-wu, Shanghai,
1935.10.

Ch'u I-tsun *Tz'u-tsung*, tseng-pu tz'u-hsüeh ts'ung-shu, I, 1968.11, 3rd ed. Shih-
ch'üeh shu-chü, Taipeh, 2 vols.

Chu Kuang-ch'ien 'Chung-kuo shih-chung szu-sheng ti fen-hsi' in *Wen-hsüeh
VIII.1*, 1937.1, 26—36.

Chung-wen ta-hsüeh. A series of five cassette recordings of poetry, chanted
in Mandarin and Cantonese, Hong Kong, n.d.

Chung-yüan yin-yün see Chou Te-ch'ing *Chung-yüan yin-yün*.

Ch'ü-lü see Chang Chi-te.

Ch'üan Yüan san-ch'ü see Sui Shu-sen Ch'üan Yüan san-ch'ü.

Fang Hao *Chung Hsi chiao-t'ung shih*, in Hsien-tai ku-o-min chi-pen chih-shih
ts'ung-shu, 5 vols.

Feng Chia-hua and Liu Chih-chung 'Liu Yung ho man-tz'ù' in *Wen-hsüeh


Feng-yüeh-t'ang shih-hua by Chu Pien (Sung).

Hsi-hsing chi szu-chung yüeh-p'ü hsüan-ch'ü, transcribed by Yang Yin-liu
and Ts'ao An-he, Yin-yüeh, Peking, 1962.1.

Hsia Ch'eng-t'ao *T'ang Sung tz'u lun-ts'ung*, Ku-tien wen-hsüeh, Shanghai,
1956.

Hsiao Ch'eng-t'ao 'Tz'u-tiao yüeh-li — shuo fan-tiao', in *Wen-shih*, II, 1963.4,
163—169.

Hsia T'ing-chih Ch'ing-lou chi, Chung-kuo ku-tien hsi-ch'ü lun-chu chi-ch'eng,

Hsü Wei 'Ch'iu-pien nan ch'iu-kung mu-lu', 1 chüan, in Ch'ü-yüan, Ch'en Na-ch'ien, 1921.
Hu Chi Sung Chìn ts'a-chü k'ao, Shanghai, 1957.
Hua-ch'iien chi, Szü-pu ts'ung-k' an ed., ch'u.
Huang Hsü-wu Shih tz'u ch'i ts'ung-tan, Shanghai shu-chü, Hong Kong, 1969 (reprint).
Jen Chung-min (= Jen Erh-pei) Tun-huang ch'i ch'ü-t'an, Shanghai, Wen-i lien-ho, 1954.11.
Ku-ch'ìn yün-hui chü-yao, Hsiung Chung (comp.), 30 chüan, supplemented and revised in the Ming dynasty, microfilm from the Peking Library.
Kuang-yün, comp. by Chou Tsu-mo, Chung-kuo k'o-hsüeh-yüan yü-yen- chiu-so chuan-k'an, III, Shang-wu, Shang-hai, 1951.4.
Kung Ying-te 'Lun tz'u ti yin-lü yü szu-sheng, in Shih-ta hsüeh-pao, IV, 1959.6, 155—163.
Leng-chai yeh-hua, by Hui Hung, Chin-tai pi-shu, ed. 1922.
Li-pu yün-lüeh, microfilm from the Peking Library of a fragment in 4 chüan.
Liang Ch'i-hsün Tz'u hsüeh ch'üan-heng, Shanghai shu-chü, Hong Kong, 1964.
Liu Fu Szu-sheng shih-yen lu, Chung-hua shu-chü, Shanghai, 1951 (reprint).
Lo Hsin-t'ien 'Ts'ao-ch'üang T'ang Sung Chin Yüan tz'u yün-p'u' in Tz'u-hsxüeh chi-k'an, I.2, 1933.8, 207.
Lu Ch'ien 'Ling-tz'u yin-lun' in Tz'u-hsxüeh chi-k'an, II.1, 1934.10, 24—6.
Lung Mu-hsun 'Lun p'ing-ts'e szu-sheng' in Tz'u-hsxüeh chi-k'an, III.2, 1936.6.30, 7—11.
Lung Mu-hsun 'Ta-he shan-jen tz'u-hua' in Tz'u-hsxüeh chi-k'an, I.3, 1933.137—146.
Lung Mu-hsun 'Tz'u-lü chih-i' in Tz'u-hsxüeh chi-k'an, I.3, 1933, 1—16.
Lung Mu-hsun 'Tz'u-t'i chih yen-chin' in Tz'u-hsxüeh chi-k'an, I.1, 1933, 1—44.
Shih Ming ‘Tz’u-t’ung (lun-yün)’ in Tz’u-hsüeh chi-k’an, I,2, 1933, 131—144.
Shih-lin kuang-chi, microfilm of a Yuan manuscript kept in the Ku-kung pow-yüan.
Sui Shu-sen (comp.) Ch’üan Yuan san-ch’ü, Chung-hua shu-chü, Peking, 1964.
Sun K’o-k’uan Yuan-tai Han wen-hua chih huo-tung, Taipeih, Chung-hua, 1968.9.
T’an Cheng-pi Hua-pen yü ku-chü, Shanghai, 1956, 2nd impr. 1957.
T’ang-shih hsüan p’ing-shih, Shang-wu, Hong Kong, 1958.6, first Hong Kong ed.
T’ao Tsung-i Ch’o-keng lu, Ts’ung-shu chi-ch’eng ed.
Ting Ming-i ‘Shan-hsi chung nan-pu ti Sung Yuan wu-t’ai’ in Wen-wu, 1972.4, 47—56.
Tu Fu [Fen-men chi-chu] Tu Kung-pu shih, Szu-pu ts’ung-k’an ed.
Tun-huang ch’ü chiao-lu, see Jen Chung-min, Tun-huang ch’ü chiao-lu.
Tung Wen-huan Sheng-tiao su-p’u t’u-shuo, preface dated 1864.
‘Tz’u-lü chien-ch’üeh’ by Hsü Ch’i, Tz’hsüeh chi-k’an, II, 127—162.
‘Tz’u-lü’ see Wan Shu, Tz’u-lü.
‘Ts’u-tsung see Chu I-tsun, Tz’u-tsung.
Tz’u-yüan shu-cheng, comp. by Ts’ai Chen, Nanking, 1932.
Wang K’ai-yün Pa-tai shih-hsüan (inaccessible).
Wang Kuang-ch’i Ch’ung-kuo yin-yüeh shih, Chung-hua pai-k’o ts’ung-shu, Chung-hua shu-chü, Shanghai, 1934.9, 2 vols.
Wang Li Han-yü shih-lü hsi-t’ieh, Hsin chih-shih, Shanghai, 1958.
Wang Li Han-yü yin-yün hsüeh, Chung-hua shu-chü, Peking, 1956.7.
Wu Tse-yu ‘Shih t’an chu-kung-tiao ti chi-ko wen-t’i’, Wen-hsüeh i-ch’an tseng-k’an, V. Tso-chia, Peking, 1957.


Yao Hua ‘Mang-fu i-kao yü Shao Po-ch’iung lun tz’u yung szu-sheng shu’ in Tz’u-hsüeh chi-k’an, II.1, 1934, 132—3.


Chiang-ts’un ts’ung-shu, 1922.

Szu-pu ts’ung-k’an, 1935—6.

Chin-tai pi-shu, 1922.

**Works in Japanese**

Abe Takeo ‘Gendai chishikijin to kakyō’ in Shirin, 42.6, 1959.9, 885—924.

Aoki, Masaru ‘Shikaku no chōtanku hattatsu no gen’ in ni tsuite’ in Shina gaku, III.9, taishō 13.9.


Kakinoki Gorō, ‘Kōzōshiki o mochiite on-soshiki o hikaku bunseki suru hōhō — minami nihon minyō no bunkakenteki bunseki’ in Nihon Tōyō ongaku ronkō, Tōyō ongakukai, 1967.


Ogawa, Tamaki ‘So Tōba koshi yōin kō’ in Gojū shūnen kinen ronshū, Kyōto daigaku bungakubu, shōwa 31.11.


Sankaishi, in Kokuyaku kambun taisei, 3, bungaku bu, I. Tokyo, shōwa 14.


Yakō shiwa, Tsunazaka, Tōyō, Nihon shiwa sōsho, II, Bunkaidō, Tokyo, taishō 9.5.

Yoshikawa, Kōjirō Gen zatsugeki kenkyū, Iwanami, Tokyo, shōwa 23 (1st ed.) 2nd impr. shōwa 29.